

Minutes

Council Committee Meeting

14 May 2019

ATTENTION

This is a Committee which has only made recommendations to Council. No action should be taken on any recommendation contained in these Minutes. The Council resolution pertaining to an item will be made at the next Ordinary Meeting of Council following this meeting.

Table of Contents

Declaration	on of Opening	3
	nd Apologies and Leave Of Absence (Previously Approved)	
1.	Public Question Time	
2.	Addresses By Members of the Public (only for items listed	
	on the agenda)	4
3.	Disclosures of Financial Interest	
4.	Disclosures of Interests Affecting Impartiality	4
4.1	Councillor McManus – PD16.19- No. 50/145 Stirling	
	Highway, Nedlands – Proposed Additional Customer	
	Seating	4
5.	Declarations by Members That They Have Not Given Due	
	Consideration to Papers	5
6.	Confirmation of Minutes	5
6.1	Committee Meeting 9 April 2019	
7.	Matters for Which the Meeting May Be Closed	5
8.	Divisional Reports	
8.1	Planning & Development Report No's PD16.19 to PD19.19	6
PD16.19	No. 50/145 Stirling Highway, Nedlands – Proposed	
	Additional Customer Seating	6
PD17.19	No. 14 Nardina Crescent, Dalkeith – Amendments to	
	DA18/33719 (Two Storey Single Dwelling)	
PD18.19	No. 154 Adelma Rd, Dalkeith – Amendment to DA17/127	
PD19.19	Natural Areas Management Plans 2019-2024	
8.2	Technical Services Report No's TS11.19	13
TS11.19	East Hollywood Parking Review Community Consultation	
	Results	13
8.3	Corporate & Strategy Report No's CPS08.19	14
	DList of Accounts Paid – March 2019	
9.	Reports by the Chief Executive Officer	
9.1	Lot 10764 John XXIII Avenue Funding Model	15
10.	Urgent Business Approved By the Presiding Member or By	
	Decision	_
11.	Confidential Items	_
Declaration	on of Closure	19

City of Nedlands

Minutes of a meeting of the Council Committee held in the Council Chambers, Nedlands on Tuesday 14 May 2019 at 7 pm.

Declaration of Opening

The Presiding Member declared the meeting open at 7 pm and drew attention to the disclaimer below.

(NOTE: Council at its meeting on 24 August 2004 resolved that should the meeting time reach 11.00 p.m. the meeting is to consider an adjournment motion to reconvene the next day).

Present and Apologies and Leave Of Absence (Previously Approved)

Councillors	Deputy Mayor Hassell	(Presiding Member)
-------------	----------------------	--------------------

Councillor I S Argyle Dalkeith Ward Councillor A W Mangano Dalkeith Ward Councillor C M de Lacy Hollywood Ward Councillor B G Hodsdon Hollywood Ward Hollywood Ward Councillor J D Wetherall Councillor G A R Hay Melvista Ward Councillor T P James Melvista Ward Councillor N W Shaw Melvista Ward Councillor N B J Horley Coastal Districts Ward Councillor L J McManus **Coastal Districts Ward** Councillor K A Smyth Coastal Districts Ward

Staff Mr M A Goodlet Chief Executive Officer

Mrs L M Driscoll
Mr P L Mickleson
Ms M Hulls
Mrs N M Ceric
Director Corporate & Strategy
Director Planning & Development
Acting Director Technical Services
Executive Assistant to CEO & Mayor

Public There was 1 member of the public present.

Press The Post Newspaper representative.

Leave of Absence His Worship the Mayor, R M C Hipkins (Previously Approved)

Apologies Nil.

Disclaimer

Members of the public who attend Council meetings should not act immediately on anything they hear at the meetings, without first seeking clarification of Council's position. For example by reference to the confirmed Minutes of Council meeting. Members of the public are also advised to wait for written advice from the Council prior to taking action on any matter that they may have before Council.

Any plans or documents in agendas and minutes may be subject to copyright. The express permission of the copyright owner must be obtained before copying any copyright material.

1. Public Question Time

Nil.

2. Addresses By Members of the Public (only for items listed on the agenda)

Ms Evelyn Lee, 14 Nardina Crescent, Dalkeith (spoke in opposition to the recommendation)

PD17.19

3. Disclosures of Financial Interest

The Presiding Member reminded Councillors and Staff of the requirements of Section 5.65 of the *Local Government Act* to disclose any interest during the meeting when the matter is discussed.

There were no disclosures of financial interest.

4. Disclosures of Interests Affecting Impartiality

The Presiding Member reminded Councillors and Staff of the requirements of Council's Code of Conduct in accordance with Section 5.103 of the *Local Government Act*.

4.1 Councillor McManus – PD16.19- No. 50/145 Stirling Highway, Nedlands – Proposed Additional Customer Seating

Councillor McManus disclosed an impartiality interest in Item PD16.19 - No. 50/145 Stirling Highway, Nedlands – Proposed Additional Customer Seating. Councillor McManus disclosed that he is friends with the owner, and as a consequence, there may be a perception that his impartiality on the matter may be affected. Councillor McManus declared that he would consider this matter on its merits and vote accordingly.

5. Declarations by Members That They Have Not Given Due Consideration to Papers

Councillor McManus advised he had not read all pages of the Natural Areas Management Plans 2019-2024 due to the size of the documents. Councillor Argyle advised the same.

6. Confirmation of Minutes

6.1 Committee Meeting 9 April 2019

Moved – Councillor Hodsdon Seconded – Councillor McManus

The Minutes of the Council Committee held 9 April 2019 be confirmed.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY 12/-

7. Matters for Which the Meeting May Be Closed

In accordance with Standing Orders and for the convenience of the public, the Committee is to identify any matter which is to be discussed behind closed doors at this meeting and that matter is to be deferred for consideration as the last item of this meeting.

Nil.

8. Divisional Reports

Note: Regulation 11(da) of the *Local Government (Administration) Regulations 1996* requires written reasons for each decision made at the meeting that is significantly different from the relevant written recommendation of a committee or an employee as defined in section 5.70, but not a decision to only note the matter or to return the recommendation for further consideration.

8.1 Planning & Development Report No's PD16.19 to PD19.19

Planning & Development Report No's PD16.19 to PD19.19 to be dealt with at this point (copy attached yellow cover sheet).

PD16.19	No. 50/145 Stirling Highway, Nedlands -
	Proposed Additional Customer Seating

Committee	14 May 2019			
Council	28 May 2019			
	,			
Applicant	G Fatouros			
Landowner	L Silby and M Gibson			
Director	Peter Mickleson – Director Planning & Development			
Employee				
Disclosure under				
section 5.70 Local	Nil			
Government Act				
1995				
Report Type	When Council determines an application/matter that			
, ,,	directly affects a person's right and interests. The			
Quasi-Judicial	judicial character arises from the obligation to abide by			
Quasi suarsia.	the principles of natural justice. Examples of Quasi-			
	Judicial authority include town planning applications			
	and other decisions that may be appealable to the			
	State Administrative Tribunal.			
Deference				
Reference	DA18/32355			
Previous Item	Nil.			
Delegation	In accordance with Clause 6.7.1a) of the City's			
	Instrument of Delegation, Council is required to			
	determine the application due to objections being			
	received.			
Attachments	Photograph of the subject property			
	Applicant's car parking bay survey			
	2. Applicant 3 car paining bay survey			

Councillor McManus – Impartiality Interest

Councillor McManus disclosed that he is friends with the owner, and as a consequence, there may be a perception that his impartiality on the matter may be affected.

Regulation 11(da) – Not Applicable – Recommendation Adopted

Moved – Councillor Shaw Seconded – Councillor de Lacy

That the Recommendation to Committee be adopted.

(Printed below for ease of reference)

CARRIED 11/-

(Abstained: Deputy Mayor Hassell)

Committee Recommendation / Recommendation to Committee

Council approves the development application dated 2 November 2018 to increase the number of customer seats from 85 to 113 at Lot 50 (No. 50/145) Stirling Highway, Nedlands, subject to the following conditions and advice notes:

- 1. The development shall at all times comply with the application and the approved plans, subject to any modifications required as a consequence of any condition(s) of this approval.
- 2. A maximum of 113 seats being permitted for the restaurant.

Advice Notes

- 1. The landowner is advised that use of the outdoor seating area is required to comply with the *Environmental Protection (Noise)* Regulations 1997, in relation to noise.
- 2. A separate application is required to be lodged and approved prior to the erection/installation of any signage on the lot.
- 3. A separate development application is required to be submitted to and approved by the City prior to increasing seating numbers any further.
- 4. Adequate staff and public sanitary conveniences shall be provided in accordance with the Building Code of Australia.
- 5. This decision does not obviate rights and responsibilities of strata owners under the *Strata Titles Act 1985*, which may require additional consultation and/or permissions from the stratum, prior to the commencement of works.
- 6. This decision constitutes planning approval only and is valid for a period of two years from the date of approval. If the subject development is not substantially commenced within the two-year period, the approval shall lapse and be of no further effect.

PD17.19	No. 14 Nardina Crescent, Dalkeith	
	Amendments to DA18/33719 (Two Sto	orey
	Single Dwelling)	_

Committee	14 May 2019		
Council	28 May 2019		
Applicant	Oswald Homes		
Landowner	PJ&JM England		
Director	Peter Mickleson – Director Planning & Development		
Employee			
Disclosure under			
section 5.70 Local	Nil		
Government Act			
1995			
Report Type	When Council determines an application/matter that directly		
	affects a person's right and interests. The judicial character		
	arises from the obligation to abide by the principles of		
	natural justice. Examples of Quasi-Judicial authority include		
	town planning applications and other decisions that may be appealable to the State Administrative Tribunal.		
Reference	DA19/35204		
Previous Item	Nil.		
Delegation	No delegation exists under Local Planning Scheme		
	No. 3 at the time of writing this report.		
Attachments	1. Site Photographs		
	2. Submission table		

Ms Evelyn Lee, 14 Nardina Crescent, Dalkeith (spoke in opposition to the recommendation)

PD17.19

Regulation 11(da) – Not Applicable – Recommendation Adopted

Moved – Councillor Shaw Seconded – Councillor Argyle

That the Recommendation to Committee be adopted.

(Printed below for ease of reference)

CARRIED 6/2

(Against: Crs. Mangano & Hay)

(Abstained: Deputy Mayor Hassell Crs. Horley McManus & Smyth)

Committee Recommendation / Recommendation to Committee

Council approves the development application dated 28 March 2019 for Amendments to DA18/33719 (Two Storey Single House) at Lot 783 No. 14 Nardina Crescent, Dalkeith, subject to the following conditions and advice:

- 1. The development shall at all times comply with the application and the approved plans, subject to any modifications required as a consequence of any condition(s) of this approval.
- 2. The previous development approval (DA18/33719, dated 07 March 2019) and conditions there-in, remain in effect. This excludes the plans approved as part of the previous development application.

Advice Notes specific to this proposal:

1. This decision constitutes development approval only and is valid for a period of two years from the date of the original development approval (07 March 2021 expiry date). If the subject development is not substantially commenced within the two-year period, the approval shall lapse and be of no further effect.

PD18.19	No. 154 Adelma Rd, Dalkeith – Amendment
	to DA17/127

Committee	4.4 May 20040
Committee	14 May 2019
Council	28 May 2019
Applicant	Seacrest Homes
Landowner	58 Ocean Drive Pty Ltd
Director	Peter Mickleson – Director Planning & Development
Employee	
Disclosure	
under section	Nil
5.70 Local	IVII
Government Act	
1995	
Report Type	When Council determines an application/matter that
. , ,	directly affects a person's right and interests. The
	judicial character arises from the obligation to abide by
Quasi-Judicial	the principles of natural justice. Examples of Quasi-
	Judicial authority include town planning applications and
	other decisions that may be appealable to the State
	Administrative Tribunal.
Reference	DA19/34565
Previous Item	OCM 22 May 2019 – PD19.18
Delegation	At the time of writing this report there is no delegation
	for officers to approve development applications.
	Further to this, the existing development approval for
	the property was obtained through Council and
	therefore amendment is more appropriately determined
	by Council.
Attachments	Site Photographs

Regulation 11(da) - Not Applicable - Recommendation Adopted

Moved – Councillor Shaw Seconded – Councillor de Lacy

That the Recommendation to Committee be adopted.

(Printed below for ease of reference)

CARRIED 9/1

(Against: Cr. Mangano)

(Abstained: Deputy Mayor Hassell Cr. McManus)

Committee Recommendation / Recommendation to Committee

Council approves the development application dated 21 February 2019 with amended plans dated 04 April 2019 to Amend the approved plans for DA17/127 (Two Storey Single House with Under-croft) at Lot 46 No. 154 Adelma Road, Dalkeith, subject to the following conditions and advice/for the following reasons:

- 1. The development shall at all times comply with the application and the approved plans, subject to any modifications required as a consequence of any condition(s) of this approval.
- 2. The previous development approval (DA17/127, dated 22 May 2018) and conditions there-in, remain in effect. This excludes the plans approved as part of the previous development application.

Advice Notes specific to this proposal:

1. This decision constitutes planning approval only and is valid for a period of two years from the date of the initial approval (22 May 2021 expiry date). If the subject development is not substantially commenced within the two-year period, the approval shall lapse and be of no further effect.

PD19.19 Natural Areas Management Plans 2019-2024

Committee	14 May 2019			
Council	28 May 2019			
Applicant	City of Nedlands			
Director	Peter Mickleson – Director Planning & Development			
Employee				
Disclosure				
under section	Nil			
5.70 Local	IVII			
Government Act				
Attachments	1. Draft Action Tables Natural Area Management			
	Plans 2019-2024.			
	Community Engagement Report			
	3. Draft Natural Areas Management Plan 2019-2024			
	4. Draft Shenton Bushland Management Plan 2019- 2024			
	5. Draft Allen Park Bushland Management Plan 2019-2024			
	6. Draft Hollywood Reserve Management Plan 2019- 2024			
	7. Draft Birdwood Parade Management Plan 2019- 2024			
	8. Draft Point Resolution Bushland Management Plan 2019-2024			
	9. Draft Mt Claremont Oval Bushland Management Plan 2019-2024.			

Procedural Motion

Moved – Councillor McManus

Seconded - Councillor Wetherall

That the Committee proceed to the next item of business.

CARRIED 10/2

(Against: Crs. de Lacy & Shaw)

Recommendation to Committee

Council adopts the seven Natural Area Management Plans including:

- 1. Natural Areas Management Plan 2019-2024;
- 2. Shenton Bushland Management Plan 2019-2024;
- 3. Allen Park Bushland Management Plan 2019-2024;
- 4. Hollywood Reserve Management Plan 2019-2024;
- 5. Birdwood Parade Management Plan 2019-2024;
- 6. Point Resolution Bushland Management Plan 2019-2024; and
- 7. Mt Claremont Oval Bushland Management Plan 2019-2024.

8.2 Technical Services Report No's TS11.19

Technical Services Report No's TS11.19 to be dealt with at this point (copy attached blue cover sheet).

TS11.19	East Hollywood Parking Review
	Community Consultation Results

Committee	14 May 2019		
Council	28 May 2019		
Applicant	City of Nedlands		
Employee Disclosure	Nil.		
under section 5.70			
Local Government			
Act 1995			
Director	Maria Hulls – Acting Director Technical Services		
Attachments	East Hollywood Precinct Area Map		
	2. Existing Parking Prohibition Map		
	3. Recommended Parking Changes Map		

Regulation 11(da) – Not Applicable – Recommendation Adopted

Moved – Councillor Wetherall Seconded – Councillor de Lacy

That the Recommendation to Committee be adopted.

(Printed below for ease of reference)

CARRIED 9/1

(Against: Cr. Mangano)

(Abstained: Deputy Mayor Hassell Cr. Horley)

Committee	Recommendation	/	Recommendation	to
Committee				

Council approves verge parking on Verdun Street to permit holders only with all other existing prohibitions to remain unchanged.

8.3 Corporate & Strategy Report No's CPS08.19

Report No's CPS08.19 to be dealt with at this point (copy attached green cover sheet).

CPS08.19	List of Accounts Paid – March 2019
----------	------------------------------------

Committee	14 May 2019
Council	28 May 2019
Applicant	City of Nedlands
Employee	Nil.
Disclosure under	
section 5.70 Local	
Government Act	
1995	
Director	Lorraine Driscoll – Director Corporate & Strategy
Attachments	Creditor Payment Listing March 2019
	2. Purchasing Card Payments March 2019 (29th February
	2019 – 28 th March 2019)

Regulation 11(da) – Not Applicable – Recommendation Adopted

Moved – Councillor Shaw Seconded – Councillor Hodsdon

That the Recommendation to Committee be adopted.

(Printed below for ease of reference)

CARRIED 11/-

(Abstained: Cr. Mangano)

Committee	Recommendation	1	Recommendation	to
Committee				

Council receives the List of Accounts Paid for the month of March 2019 (refer to attachments).

9. Reports by the Chief Executive Officer

9.1 Lot 10764 John XXIII Avenue Funding Model

Committee	14 May 2019		
Council	28 May 2019		
Applicant	City of Nedlands		
Employee	Nil.		
Disclosure under	IVII.		
section 5.70 Local			
Government Act			
1995			
CEO	Mark Goodlet		
Attachments	4. Letter from Minister Wyatt's Acting Chief of Staff		
	to the City dated 18 April 2019		
	5. Lot 10764 John XXIII Avenue Valuation		
	(Confidential)		
	6. Funding Model (Confidential)		

Regulation 11(da) – Not Applicable – Recommendation Adopted

Moved – Councillor McManus Seconded – Councillor Shaw

That the Recommendation to Committee be adopted.

(Printed below for ease of reference)

CARRIED 9/1

(Against: Cr. Smyth)

(Abstained: Crs. Mangano & Horley)

Committee Recommendation / Recommendation to Committee

That Council does not proceed with the freehold purchase of Lot 10764 John XXIII Ave for Public Open Space Purposes.

Executive Summary

The Department for Planning Lands and Heritage undertook an expression of interest process for the sale of lot 10764 John XXIII Avenue, which ended on 12 October 2018. This lot is being zoned as urban under the Metropolitan Region Scheme.

Council directed that a valuation and funding model be provided for lot 10764, with a view to consideration of purchase of this lot. This report provides the required information and recommends that Council does not proceed with purchase of this lot.

Discussion/Overview

Background

The Department for Planning Lands and Heritage undertook an expression of interest process for lot 10764 John XXIII Avenue, which ended on 12 October 2018. The City unsuccessfully sought gifting of this lot from the State Government in this process. The City has not been advised of the outcome of the expression of interest process at this point.

Land Area			16,641m ²		
Local Planning Scheme Zone			No Zone		
Current Metropolitan Region Scheme Zone			Public Purpose – Hospital		
Omnibus	No.5	Metropolitan	Region	Scheme	Urban
Proposed Zone					



Figure 1. Lot 10764, John XXIII Avenue

Key Relevant Previous Council Decisions:

Item 14.4 Council Meeting of 26 February 2019 – Council Resolution

Council authorises the CEO to investigate the acquisition of Lot 10764 John XXIII Ave for public open space and recreation purposes by:

- 1. Request again that the State Government vest this Lot in the City of Nedlands for POS/recreation purposes by writing to the Minister for Lands and by seeking a meeting with the Minister and/or relative parties.
- 2. If they again refuse, to investigate purchase of this Lot including the funding model.
- 3. Immediately arrange for a sworn valuation of this Lot.
- 4. Report back to Council by 30/4/19.

State Government Response, Valuation and Funding Model

The City again wrote to the State Government and was again advised that they would be proceeding with the sale of the property (Attachment 1).

A valuation of Lot 10764 was provided by Hemsley Paterson (Attachment 2). This and a funding model were developed and provided to Councillors on 30 April 2019.

A purchase option based on debt alone was considered however the City's ability to service debt is limited to an additional \$2.2M, meaning that additional funding would be required. The Funding Model therefore considers two purchase options for the land. The first is for purchase through borrowings, supplemented with land sale, while the second is for purchase through sale of land alone.

Budget/Financial Implications

The funding model is provided as confidential Attachment 3.

By way of summary the City would need to consider, in the context of the Long-Term Financial Plan, the most appropriate combination of funding models to meet the cost of the land purchase.

It is certain that the funding model must include either sale of City freehold land and debt servicing as a combination, or sale of City freehold land equal to the value of lot 10764 and purchasing costs.

The option that would have least impact on services and rates would be the sales of freehold land to fully fund purchase of lot 10764. The option with debt servicing will have significant impacts on the provision of services and on rates.

Consultation

A memorandum from the Chief Executive Office was circulated to Councillors on 30 April 2019 with the valuation and the funding model.

Comments

In creating public open space, the Land Administration Act 1997 provides a low-cost mechanism for acquisition of crown land vested in the local government for the purpose of recreation. Acquiring freehold land for the purpose of recreation ties up City equity permanently in land that the City will be unable to realize any future financial value from.

The subject land has no zoning under LPS3 but is in the process of being rezoned under the Metropolitan Regional Scheme (MRS) from "Hospital Purposes" to "Urban" presumably to ensure a wider range of potential uses and therefore a higher market value. To assist this the Minister also amended the Odour Buffer Zone for the Subiaco Waste Water Plant in LPS3 to specifically exclude this site from the buffer zone and therefore allow the possibility of "sensitive uses" (i.e. residential) which is also likely to enhance the land's value. However, there is a separate State Policy that effectively "reapplies" this buffer to the site and requires a case by case assessment of any proposed development.

This creates significant uncertainty regarding the valuation of the land, so the given valuation has been used for the funding model. Should the funding model have assumed a higher value for the land, such as residential, the impacts on debt servicing, reduction in services, and rates increase would all be worse for the City.

The valuation received assumes an Urban zoning under the MRS, as the land value would be significantly reduced with the current Hospital Purpose zone or indeed if it was Public Open Space (POS). This creates a significant issue for Council if it were to acquire the land in that it would be paying a price based on the highest and best use and would then need to, in effect, write off most of this value if it was to be used for POS and any land zoned or reserved for such or similar purposes has effectively no market value.

Conclusion

Purchase of lot 10764, John XXIII Avenue is not recommended. The City is constrained by its debt servicing capacity and purchase using debt servicing is not recommended. Purchase of this lot as freehold land will lock away City equity permanently. Where possible public open space should be placed on Crown reserve vested in the City.



Hon Ben Wyatt MLA Treasurer; Minister for Finance; Aboriginal Affairs; Lands

Our Ref:

69-13369

Mr Peter Mickleson Director Planning and Development City of Nedlands

Via email: rcrabtree@nedlands.wa.gov.au

Dear Mr Mickleson

LOT 10764 JOHN XXIII AVENUE MT CLAREMONT - LAND DISPOSAL BID

I refer to your correspondence dated 22 March 2019 to the Hon Rita Saffioti MLA, regarding Lot 10764, John XXIII Avenue in Mount Claremont.

I confirm that, as per the response from Minister Saffioti to your request dated 2 November 2018 (copy attached), the land will be sold via a competitive process, wherein the City will be provided with an opportunity to purchase.

The Department of Planning, Lands and Heritage has recorded the City's interest in the site and will forward all relevant information when the sale process is commenced.

Yours sincerely

Aaron Morey

A/CHIEF OF STAFF

Att.

18 APR 2019

10.	Urgent Business Approved By the Presiding Member or By Decision
	Nil.

11. Confidential Items

Nil.

Declaration of Closure

There being no further business, the Presiding Member declared the meeting closed at 7.45 pm.