

# Minutes

## **Public Art Committee Meeting**

## **13 September 2021**

#### ATTENTION

This is a Committee which has only made recommendations to Council. No action should be taken on any recommendation contained in these Minutes. The Council resolution pertaining to an item will be made at the next Ordinary Meeting of Council following this meeting.

## **Table of Contents**

Declaratio	n of Opening	3	
Present and Apologies and Leave of Absence (Previously Approved)			
1.	Public Question Time	4	
2.	Addresses by Members of the Public (only for items listed on the		
	agenda)	4	
3.	Disclosures of Financial and/or Proximity Interest	4	
4.	Disclosures of Interests Affecting Impartiality	4	
5.	Declarations by Members That They Have Not Given Due		
	Consideration to Papers	4	
6.	Confirmation of Minutes	5	
6.1	Public Art Committee Meeting 21 June 2021	5	
7.	Items for Discussion	5	
7.1	Health Workers' Tribute Project Update	5	
7.2	Valuation of Public Artworks	13	
8.	Date of Next Meeting	19	
Declaratio	Declaration of Closure		

#### **City of Nedlands**

Minutes of a meeting of the Public Art Committee held at the City of Nedlands Administration Building, 71 Stirling Highway and online via Microsoft Teams on Monday 13 September 2021 at 5.30pm.

#### **Declaration of Opening**

The presiding member declared the meeting open at 5:30pm.

#### Present and Apologies and Leave of Absence (Previously Approved)

Councillors and Voting Members	Deputy Mayor L McMar Councillor B Hodsdon Councillor K Smyth Councillor B Tyson Councillor A Mangano Ms A Thompson Mr Luke Hollyock	nus Coastal Districts Ward Hollywood Ward Coastal Districts Ward Melvista Ward Dalkeith Ward Community Member Community Member		
Staff	Ms M Granich Ms L Macfarlane Reid Ms R Stewart Ms B Castelli	Manager Community Development Arts Centre Co-ordinator A/Community Development Officer Administration and Events Officer		
Public	Nil.			
Press	Nil.			
Leave of Absence (Previously Approved) Nil.				

Apologies

#### Disclaimer

Members of the public who attend Council meetings should not act immediately on anything they hear at the meetings, without first seeking clarification of Council's position. For example, by reference to the confirmed Minutes of Council meeting. Members of the public are also advised to wait for written advice from the Council prior to taking action on any matter that they may have before Council.

Any plans or documents in agendas and minutes may be subject to copyright. The express permission of the copyright owner must be obtained before copying any copyright material.

#### 1. Public Question Time

Nil.

#### 2. Addresses by Members of the Public (only for items listed on the agenda)

Addresses by members of the public who have completed Public Address Session Forms will be invited to be made as each item relating to their address is discussed by the Committee.

Nil.

#### 3. Disclosures of Financial and/or Proximity Interest

The Presiding Member reminded Councillors and Staff of the requirements of Section 5.65 of the *Local Government Act* to disclose any interest during the meeting when the matter is discussed.

There were no disclosures of financial interest.

#### 4. Disclosures of Interests Affecting Impartiality

The Presiding Member reminded Councillors and Staff of the requirements of Council's Code of Conduct in accordance with Section 5.103 of the *Local Government Act*.

There were no disclosures affecting impartiality.

## 5. Declarations by Members That They Have Not Given Due Consideration to Papers

Nil.

#### 6. Confirmation of Minutes

#### 6.1 Public Art Committee Meeting 21 June 2021

Moved – Councillor Smyth Seconded – Councillor Tyson

The Minutes of the Public Art Committee 21 June 2021 be accepted as a true and correct record of that meeting.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY 7/-

#### 7. Items for Discussion

#### 7.1 Health Workers' Tribute Project Update

Committee	13 September 2021
Applicant	City of Nedlands
Employee Disclosure	Nil.
under section 5.70 of	
the Local	
Government Act	
1995	
Officer	Marion Granich, Executive Manager Community
Attachments	Nil.
Confidential	Nil.
Attachments	

#### Regulation 11(da) – Not Applicable, recommendation adopted.

Moved – Councillor McManus Seconded – Councillor Tyson

#### **Recommendation to Committee / Committee Recommendation**

That the Public Art Committee receives this report as an update on the progress of the Health Workers Tribute Artwork.

#### **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY 7/-**

#### **Executive Summary**

The purpose of this report is to provide the Public Art Committee with an update on the progress of the Health Workers Tribute project, a public artwork aimed at recognizing the work of health workers during the pandemic. With the necessary Council approvals in place, the project is now underway. The report outlines what has been done to date; how the project will progress; and the Public Art Committee's role in shortlisting artists, as well as selecting the successful artist who will be commissioned to undertake the project.

## Background

The Health Workers Tribute project was initiated by the Public Art Committee in May 2020, with the aim of paying tribute to the role that health workers have played during the COVID19 pandemic. Since then, there have been a series of Public Art Committee recommendations to Council, as well as number of Council decisions on the project. Those decisions are provided under the Previous Council Decisions section of this report.

In June 2021, the Public Art Committee was advised that Council had approved the use of Dot Bennett Park for the siting of this artwork; and expenditure on the project, including expenditure of \$20,000 on a public art consultant to co-ordinate the consultant. Since the June meeting of the Public Art Committee, a public art consultant has been appointed, and further information on that appointment is provided below.

## **Discussion/Overview**

#### **Appointment of Public Art Consultant**

Following the Council decision to approve funding for the project, including the funding of a public art consultant, Administration called for Requests for Quotation from suitably experienced public art consultants. Three RFQ's were received, with Alison Barrett appointed as the successful applicant.

Alison Barret is a highly qualified and experienced public art consultant. She has previously worked closely with Council in her role as consultant to the Nedlands Cultural and Community Society, which commissioned most of the City's public artwork. Of particular relevance to this project is Alison's public art consultancy work with the Department of Health on various health centres and hospitals, including the Perth Children's Hospital, as well as her contacts throughout the WA health sector, including the service delivery and research arms of the sector. As well as being a highly experienced public art consultant with decades of a successful track-record in the commissioning of public art, Alison is also a City of Nedlands resident, with a demonstrated commitment to having a high standard of public art in the City of Nedlands. Further, Alison's quotation was competitive on price.

## **Next Steps**

With Alison appointed to the role, the project is now underway. The consultancy is being supervised by the Tresillian Coordinator, Lisa Macfarlane Reid. The consultant is currently in the process of drafting the artist brief, which will form the basis of calling for Expressions of Interest from artists interested in undertaking the commission. The call for EOI's will be advertised and submissions received.

Once submissions have been received from interested artists, the Public Art Committee will then:

- review the applications received and short-list to 3 artists
- receive presentations from the 3 shortlisted artists
- decide the winning proposal.

The Public Art Committee's next major role in the project will be to review all submissions received, then shortlist, probably to 3 applications. However, before the Committee can shortlist the applications, the following key things need to occur:

- call for Expressions of Interest from artists from 17 24 September 2021
- deadline for artists to submit proposals 20 October 2021.

It is expected that the Public Art Committee will review all applications and shortlist them, at the earliest available date after November 2021. The date of this next Public Art Committee meeting is not yet confirmed, as it will be impacted by Council elections in October 2021. All Committees of Council are disbanded just before a Council election. Following the October Council election, Council we consider the matter of Committees of Council, including the Public Art Committee. Once that has occurred, assuming the Public Art Committee is to continue, the date for the next Public Art Committee meeting will be set.

#### **Key Relevant Previous Council Decisions:**

 18 May 2020 – Item 7.3 - Public Art Committee Recommendation – Public Art Budget

"Committee Recommendation

That the Public Art Committee:

- 1. receives this information on the funds available for public art in the current financial year;
- 2. recommends that Council approves \$50,000 for expenditure on public art when considering the 2020/21 Council budget; and
- 3. recommends to Council the acquisition of a public artwork that commemorates the work of medical staff during the COVID-19 pandemic, from the 2020/21 Public Art Budget allocation."
- 23 June 2020 CM04.20 Council Resolution Public Art Budget 2021

"Council Resolution

That Council:

- 1. receives the information that there are no remaining funds available for public art in the current financial year;
- 2. includes consideration of \$50,000 from the Public Art Reserve Fund in the draft 2020/21 Council budget for expenditure on public art; and
- 3. approves the acquisition of a public artwork that commemorates the work of people in the health-related industry during the COVID-19 pandemic, from the 2020/21 Public Art Budget allocation.

Advice Notes:

- 1. The City will approach the Health Department, Hollywood Hospital, City of Perth and other related stakeholders for potential collaboration in the selection criteria and contribution of funds; and
- 2. The Public Art Committee will investigate suitable locations in the City's Parks such as: Leura Park, Highview Park, Karella Park.
- 17 August 2020 Item 7.3 Public Art Committee Recommendation Health Professionals Recognition Artwork

"Committee Recommendation

The Public Art Committee:

- 1. defers the decision on the location until the artwork is chosen; and
- 2. requests administration supplies information on artworks available for purchase."
- 12 October 2020 Item 7.1 Public Art Committee Recommendation Health Professionals Tribute Project

"Committee Recommendation

That the Public Art Committee:

- considers the range of public artworks available to be purchased, at confidential Attachment 1 – Artworks Available for Purchase for Health Professionals Tribute Project;
- selects 'Circle "Yakibame" (Shrink Fit) (C-11)' by Tetsuro amasaki as the Committee's preferred work; and
- 3. selects Dot Bennett Park as the Committee's preferred location for the siting of this work."

 24 November 2020 – CM10.20 - Council Resolution – Public Artwork Health Workers Tribute Project

"Council Resolution / Committee Recommendation

That Council request the Public Art Committee to pursue the option of a commissioned public art piece from a WA artist, in light of the limited choice of off the shelf selections available."

• 15 March 2021 – Item 7.1 - Public Art Committee Recommendation – Health Workers' Tribute Project

"Committee Recommendation

The Public Art Committee recommends Council:

- 1. approves the transfer of an additional \$20,000 from Council's Art Reserve Account for expenditure on a consultant to undertake the work involved in commissioning an artwork, rather than purchasing an existing work;
- 2. approves the expenditure of up to \$50,000 on the commission of the artwork itself (including advertising, artist fees, fabrication, traffic management, foundations, plaque and installation) from the 2020/21 approved Council budget; and
- 3. approves Dot Bennett Park as the site for the Health Workers' Tribute public art project."
- 25 May 2021 CSD05.21 Council Resolution Health Workers' Tribute Project

"Council Resolution / Committee Recommendation / Recommendation to Committee

Council:

- 1. approves the transfer of an additional \$20,000 from Council's Art Reserve Account for expenditure on a consultant to undertake the work involved in commissioning an artwork, rather than purchasing an existing work;
- 2. approves the expenditure of up to \$50,000 on the commissioning of the artwork itself (including advertising, artist fees, fabrication, traffic management, foundations, plaque and installation) from the approved 2020/21 Council budget; and
- 3. approves Dot Bennett Park as the site for the Health Workers' Tribute public art project."

• 21 June 2021 – Item 8.2 - Public Art Committee Recommendation – Health Workers' Tribute Project Update

"Committee Recommendation

The Public Art Committee:

- 1. receives the update provided on the Health Workers Tribute Project;
- 2. notes the following steps involved in the project:
  - a. Administration appoints public art consultant
  - b. Consultant calls for EOI's from public artists
  - c. Public Art Committee shortlists submissions received
  - d. Short-listed artists present proposals to the Public Art Committee
  - e. Public Art Committee selects the work to be commissioned;
- 3. requests that the following matters are given due consideration in the call for Expressions of Interest from public artists:
  - a. Public safety
  - b. Longevity
  - c. Durability
  - d. No controversial human form
  - e. Minimal installation expenditure
  - f. Fine tune the location
  - g. Contain the cost within the budget
  - h. Develop a relationship with appropriate stakeholders."
- 27 July 2021 Item 13.5 Council Resolution Adoption of the Annual Budget 2021/22 – Attachment 1

## Policy / Legislation

The *Local Government Act WA 1995* requires that Committees of Council are disbanded prior to a Council election. Following the Council election, a Council decision is required to re-instate the Committee and appoint its members.

## Consultation

The Public Art Committee's Terms of Reference provide for community members to be full voting members of the Committee, allowing community input into the recommendations by this Committee to Council.

## **Strategic Implications**

#### How well does it fit with our strategic direction?

The work of the Public Art Committee adds to the amenity of the area and is consistent with the vision outlined in the City's Strategic Community Plan, which states that "We will live in a beautiful place".

#### Who benefits?

The residential community and visitors to the area benefit from the City having a high aesthetic values, including a high standard of public art.

#### Does it involve a tolerable risk?

Risks in relation to installing public art are mitigated by ensuring that all public art meets safety, longevity and maintenance standards; and is within approved budget.

#### Do we have the information we need?

The City has the necessary Council and Public Art Committee decisions in place, to proceed with calling for Expressions of Interest from artists who are interested in competing for this commission.

## **Budget/Financial Implications**

The following expenditure has been approved by Council:

- \$50,000 on the artwork, including its commission and installation; and
- \$20,000 on the public art consultancy.

The call for Expressions of Interest from artists will state the artwork to be commissioned must be created, fabricated and installed within a budget of \$50,000.

#### Can we afford it?

Yes, the funds for the artwork and the consultant have been approved within the current financial year's budget.

#### How does the option impact upon rates?

The impact on rates has already been considered within the context of the approved 2021/22 Council budget.

## Conclusion

The Public Art Committee first initiated this inspiring project in May 2020, aiming to recognise the role of health workers during the COVID19 pandemic. The Committee's initial approach was to consider existing artworks that were available to bought. However, the approach later changed to commissioning a new work especially for this project; and a consultant appointed to co-ordinate the project.

The necessary expenditure for the project and the use of Dot Bennett Park as its location have been approved by Council. A public art consultant has been appointed to co-ordinate the project. The call for Expressions of Interest from public artists will soon be advertised. Once applications are received, these will be reviewed and shortlisted by Public Art Committee members, with the final successful artist being selected by them.

The project is now underway, and following the Council election in October, it is expected that the Public Art Committee will reconvene to complete the project.

## 7.2 Valuation of Public Artworks

Committee	13 September 2021
Applicant	City of Nedlands
Employee	Nil.
Disclosure under	
section 5.70 of the	
Local Government	
Act 1995	
Officer	Marion Granich, Executive Manager Community
Attachments	Nil.
Confidential	1. Confidential Attachment – Public Art Valuation
Attachments	Report 2021.

Regulation 11(da) – The Committee agreed that the cost of each public art work should be listed separately from the installation costs to clearly identify the value of the art work itself.

Moved – Luke Hollyock Seconded – Alexandrea Thompson

The Public Art Committee receives the Public Art Valuation Report 2021, as at confidential attachment 1 – Public Art Valuation Report 2021.

<u>Amendment</u> Moved – Councillor Smyth Seconded – Councillor Tyson

That the following advice note be included:

In respect of original cost, that information on the installation costs is separated from the amount paid to the artists on public art works where it is possible and be returned to the next meeting of the Public Art Committee.

> CARRIED 6/1 (Against: Cr. McManus)

The Substantive Motion was PUT and was

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY 7/-

#### **Committee Recommendation**

The Public Art Committee receives the Public Art Valuation Report 2021, as at confidential attachment 1 – Public Art Valuation Report 2021 with the following advice note:

In respect of original cost, that information on the installation costs is separated from the amount paid to the artists on public art works where it is possible and be returned to the next meeting of the Public Art Committee.

Recommendation to Committee

The Public Art Committee receives the Public Art Valuation Report 2021, as at confidential attachment 1 – Public Art Valuation Report 2021.

## **Executive Summary**

This report is presented to the Public Art Committee for information only. The purpose of this report is to inform the Committee about the measures Administration has taken to determine an accurate financial value for the City's public art collection. Determining the financial value of each of these public artworks will help the City ensure appropriate management and insurance of the works as an asset class.

The independent valuation of the City's public art collection shows that it is now worth > \$1.3 million.

## Background

The City owns a significant public art collection, made up of 16 major works located throughout the City. Some of these artworks, such as the Trolley Poles along Stirling Highway, are in fact made up of a number of individual works.

The public artworks in the City's collection are:

- 1. Asteroids by Rick Vermey
- 2. Boat Story by Claire Bailey
- 3. 6009 by Anne Neil and Steve Tepper
- 4. Feathers by Anne Neil
- 5. A Walk in the Park by Judith Forrest (13 individual works)
- 6. Snapshots of Lupin Hill by Judith Forrest (3 individual works)
- 7. Trolley Pole Banners by Tony Pankiw (6 individual works)
- 8. Group of Little People by Richie Kuhaupt (3 individual works)
- 9. The Odd Couple by Susan Flavell (2 individual works)

- 10. Burnside Spit, Hall Mark and Outer Dolphin by Tony Jones (3 individual works)
- 11. Grandis Leaf by Leanne Bray
- 12. Loyalty by Ayad Alqaragholli
- 13. Inspired by Rosie by Tania Spencer
- 14. Windows into the Past by Tony Pankiw
- 15. Fisher Boy by Unknown Thai Artist
- 16. Nesting Fields by Lorenna Grant.
- Works 1 10, as listed above, were commissioned by the Nedlands Cultural and Community Society in the period 2000 – 2010, and donated to the City. The original value of these works was \$528,050.
- Works 11 14, as listed above, were the only works in the collection that were commissioned or purchased solely by the City, and therefore fully funded by Council. The original value of these works was \$234,400.
- Work 15, as listed above, was installed as part of the All Abilities Play Space and was therefore purchased from funds raised by Rotary. The original value in 2018 was \$12,000.
- Work 16, as listed above, was installed and paid for as part of a development undertaken by the state government. The original value in 2007 was \$56,000.

While the City information on the original value of each artwork, some of these works were installed over 2 decades ago and values may have changed. Therefore, in February 2021 the City appointed art consultant Jude Van de Merwe to undertake a valuation of the City's public art collection. Following that appointment, the Public Art Committee was advised of the project at its meeting of March 2021. The consultancy was completed in June 2021, with the City now having up-to-date financial valuations of each work in the collection. Further information about the Public Art Valuation Report 2021 is provided below.

## Discussion

#### **Public Art Valuation Report 2021**

The Public Art Valuation Report 2021 is attached to this report as a confidential attachment. It is provided as a confidential attachment to protect commercial and professional sensitivities around the estimated financial values of individual artworks. Releasing information about the financial value of individual works could cause unnecessary embarrassment to artists, including those with whom the City has worked co-operatively and productively in the past, or intends to

future. However, the report contains much aggregated information that is of interest and value to the Committee and that information is provided below. **Summary of the Valuation Report** 

Some key items that can be extrapolated from the Public Artwork Valuation Report are as follows:

- The City's public artwork collection has appreciated. The total original cost of all items in the collection the was > \$800,000. This has appreciated to > \$1.3 million.
- The works commissioned by the Nedlands Cultural and Community Society (2000 2010) have appreciated considerably. Their totally original cost was \$528,000. They are now worth \$949,000.
- The works commissioned or purchased the City (2016 2020) are more recent, so have had less time to appreciate. However, they have appreciated from an original total cost of \$234,000 to a current value of \$271,350.
- One artwork, commissioned as part of a state government development at an original cost of \$56,000 in 2007 is now valued at \$120,000.
- Council funded only 4 of the public artworks in its collection. The original cost of the works funded by Council was \$434,400. Today, Council owns a public artwork collection worth > \$1.3 million.

The key items, above, extrapolated from the Public Artwork Valuation Report, show that public art has been an appreciating investment for Council, as well as providing non-financial benefits, such as adding to the amenity of the area and providing the interest, reflection and even controversy that excellent public art can stimulate.

## Key Relevant Previous Council Decisions:

 15 March 2021 – Public Art Committee agenda item – Valuation Public Artworks.

While the Public Art Valuation Report has not been considered by Council as yet, it is intended that a summary of the report is provided to Council for information only, to ensure Councillors are aware of the financial appreciation of the investment that the City has made in public art.

## **Policy / Legislation**

The Public Art Committee's Terms of Reference outline its purpose in recommending to Council matters to do with public art.

## Consultation

The Public Art Committee includes as full voting members 2 community members, to ensure community input into the recommendations that the Committee makes to Council regarding public art.

## **Strategic Implications**

#### How well does it fit with our strategic direction?

Protecting and insuring the City's existing public art collection should be of a higher priority than acquiring new public artworks, since those new public artworks would be at risk if there are not adequate measures in place to value, insure and maintain the existing collection. It is a common strategic mistake to emphasize acquisition at the expense of maintenance of an art collection.

#### How well does it fit with our strategic direction?

In its vision statement, the City's Strategic Community Plan states that *We will live in a beautiful place*. The work of the Public Art Committee contributes to this vision and therefore is consistent with the City's strategic direction as stated in the Plan. In particular, this project, of valuing the City's public art collection, is an important step in protecting the collection into the future.

#### Who benefits?

All community members in the City of Nedlands benefit from high quality public art that enhances the amenity of the City. Additionally, the reputation and standing of the City will be enhanced by undertaking this inspiring and community-minded project in recognition of health workers.

#### Do we have the information we need?

Yes, this update on the current financial value of each of the works in the City's public art collection will enable to City to appropriately insure its collection; and will provide the City with an objective determination of each works replacement value, should damage to one of the works take place that requires a replacement of that work.

## **Budget/Financial Implications**

#### Can we afford it?

There is no financial cost to accepting the information in this report. Having access to this updated valuation of the City's public art collection has a positive impact on the value of the City's assets, in that their value can be more accurately reflected for insurance purposes.

#### How does the option impact upon rates?

There is no impact on rates from accepting the information in this report.

## Conclusion

No public artworks can be expected to last indefinitely, despite the City managing risk by select only experienced, well-trained public artists whose work meets high standards of durability, safety and minimal maintenance. From time-to-time, damage or deterioration may occur; and the artwork will then be the subject of an insurance claim by the City. The City's public artworks are generally insured for replacement value. Therefore, it is important to have a reasonably current valuation of the works, so that the replacement value can be substantiated by the independent valuation. The City now has that valuation, which shows that there has been considerable appreciation of the City's public art collection.

Four bodies have funded the City's current public art collection, being the Nedlands Cultural and Community Society; Council; the state government; and Rotary. Together, these 4 bodies have outlaid a total cost of \$810,450. Today, the collection is worth > \$1.3 million. It is recommendation that the Public Art Committee receives the information in the Public Artwork Valuation report, showing the considerable appreciation of the value of the City's collection over time.

## 8. Date of Next Meeting

The date of the next meeting of the Public Art Committee is to be advised.

#### **Declaration of Closure**

There being no further business, the Presiding Member declared the meeting closed at 6.00pm.