



City of Nedlands

# Technical Services Reports

**Committee Consideration – 8 November 2016**  
**Council Resolution – 22 November 2016**

## Table of Contents

Item No.		Page No.
TS14.16	Tender No. 2016/17.01 Nedlands River Wall Foreshore Restoration Stage 1 .....	2

<b>TS14.16</b>	<b>Tender No. 2016/17.01 Nedlands River Wall Foreshore Restoration Stage 1</b>
----------------	--

<b>Committee</b>	08 November 2016
<b>Council</b>	22 November 2016
<b>Applicant</b>	City of Nedlands
<b>Officer</b>	Wayne Mo – Design Engineer
<b>Director</b>	Martyn Glover – Director Technical Services
<b>Director Signature</b>	
<b>File Reference</b>	TS-PRO-00134
<b>Previous Item</b>	Ordinary Meeting of Council 24 November 2015, Item TS30.15

## Executive Summary

To award the contract for the Nedlands River Wall Foreshore Restoration works Stage 1.

## Recommendation to Committee

### Council:

1. agrees to award Tender No. 2016/17.01 to Natural Area Holdings Pty Ltd for the Nedlands river wall foreshore restoration works Stage 1 as per the lump sum price (confidential Attachment 1) submitted; and
2. authorises the Chief Executive Officer to sign an acceptance of offer for this tender.

## Strategic Plan

KFA: Natural and Built Environment

To manage the City's assets in a sustainable and responsible manner and to provide quality riverbank access for community recreational activities.

## Background

### Nedlands River Walls

The City of Nedlands manages approximately 2km of Swan River foreshore between Broadway and Iris Avenue which is largely protected by vertical river walls. Mainly due to its age, the river wall is in very poor condition, is failing in some places and coming to the end of its useful life. In the 2013/14 financial year a section of the wall collapsed

completely. An application for the maintenance work on this section was approved by the Swan River Trust and works were carried out from March to May 2014 costing the City approximately \$155,000. These works consisted of temporary repairs to the river wall including erosion control, and the installation of geotextile sand containers behind the wall. It was identified at the time that it was critical to commence permanent replacement upgrades to the wall.

To assist in preparation of a 'Repair and Replacement Strategy', a condition assessment was undertaken to identify the worst affected sections of the wall for staging required replacement works. The worst section was identified as being between Iris Avenue and the Royal Flying Squadron Yacht Club. Much of this 650m length of wall consists of sections that have either completely failed and require immediate replacement, or are about to fail.



*Figure 1 - Collapsed section of river wall (October 2016)*

Two design options were considered as part of the replacement strategy. Replacing 'like for like' with traditional vertical walls is expensive and only provides a short term solution. The second design option includes the construction of rock revetment which:

- has a lesser environmental impact than vertical walls;
- eliminates the need to deal with Potential Acid Sulfide Soils;
- is easier to construct;
- is cost effective;
- is easier to maintain;
- provides an opportunity for landscape softening;
- has the ability to dissipate wave energy which reduces wave spray and damage on the foreshore; and
- prolongs the life of the wall and therefore offers a longer term solution.

The rock revetment option has been successfully used around various locations around South Perth and the Old Swan Brewery. The design of Stage 1 of the river wall is included in Attachment 2.



*Figure 2 - Concept Image - Rock revetment along a Nedlands river wall*

## **Funding**

In most cases, subject to a successful grant funded application with the Department of Parks and Wildlife (DPaW), riverside Councils such as Nedlands generally share a dollar for dollar funding model, 1/2 funded from by DPaW, and 1/2 funded by the City for river wall restoration works.

In this circumstance, recognising the importance of these works to both parties, DPaW offered to increase their contribution to the works and proposed a funding model of 2/3 funded by DPaW, and 1/3 funded by the City. A Collaborative Agreement (P16NL01) was drawn up and signed by the City to guarantee the funds from DPaW. Subsequently DPaW have contributed \$800,000 to the City as their 2/3 share towards the cost of the works. On receipt of DpaW's contribution, the project was included in the 2015/16 Capital Works Programme (CWP) and carried forward into the 2016/17 CWP.

## **Capital Tender**

The expenditure for the Stage 1 restoration works will exceed \$150,000. Therefore, to comply with legislative requirements outlined in the *Local Government Act 1995* and ensure the best value for money for the City, this service must be tendered.

The tender was advertised on Monday 29 August 2016 in the West Australian Newspaper and the tender submission period closed at 2:00 pm Wednesday 28 September 2016.

Six conforming tender submissions were received:

1. Natural Area Holdings Pty Ltd;
2. MMM WA Pty Ltd;
3. Civcon Civil and Project Management Pty Ltd;
4. EcoProjects Australia Pty Ltd;
5. Engineered Water Systems Pty Ltd; and
6. Yarnell Civil and Mining Pty Ltd.

### **Key Relevant Previous Council Decisions:**

a) In response to TS03.15 River Wall Funding, it was resolved at the Ordinary meeting of Council on 24 February 2015 that;

*Council:*

1. *Approves Stage 1 detailed design of the rock revetment solution for the river wall;*
2. *Approves funding in the 2014/15 budget to the value of \$76,560. This funding to be made up of a re-allocation of \$44,050 of City funds from the Tawarri Jetty project (non-reserve) and grant funding of \$32,510 from the Swan River Trust;*
3. *Authorises the Chief Executive Officer to sign a collaborative agreement between the City of Nedlands and Swan River Trust for the Nedlands River Wall Foreshore Restoration P15NL01; and*
4. *Approves consideration of funding in the 2015/16 budget as follows:*
  - a. *\$11,880, being \$5,940 from City funds and \$5,940 from Swan River Trust grant funds as part of the collaborative agreement between the parties; and*
  - b. *\$465,500, being \$299,250 from City funds and \$166,250 from Swan River Trust funds, for construction of the river wall and subject to a successful grant application.*

b) In response to TS30.15 Funding for River Wall Maintenance it was resolved at the Ordinary meeting of Council on 24 November 2015 that;

*Council:*

1. *To include \$400,000 plus overheads in the 2016/17 draft budget, being \$150,000 of City funds and \$250,000 from Department of Parks and Wildlife funds, for repair of the river wall, and subject to a successful grant application;*
2. *To include \$800,000 plus overheads in the 2017/18 draft budget, being \$250,000 of City funds and \$550,000 from Department of Parks and Wildlife funds, for repair of the river wall, and subject to a successful grant application;*
3. *Authorises the Chief Executive Officer to sign a collaborative agreement between the City of Nedlands and The Department of Parks and Wildlife for the Nedlands River Wall Foreshore Restoration P15NL01; and*
4. *Administration to note that no fencing of the river beyond that essential for public safety on a temporary basis is to be undertaken.*

## Consultation

Required by legislation: Yes  No   
Required by City of Nedlands policy: Yes  No

A community consultation plan was developed and implemented for the 'long term planning for the river wall', presenting the overall concept plan for the river wall upgrades. The community were invited to provide feedback during December 2014 on the proposals to construct a combination of limestone wall, rock revetment and pocket beaches along the foreshore.

The community were notified of the invitation to provide feedback through a letter drop, the City's website, community engagement newsletters and the POST newspaper. A stand advertising the proposal was also set up at the City's annual 'Blessing of the River' event, generating substantially positive feedback. A total of 16 people responded.

Of the respondents that clearly indicated whether they were in support or against the overall proposal, support for the entire concept was high with 86% in favour.

Two respondents did not specifically confirm if they were in support of the proposal or not, however their comments did indicate they were in support of the rock revetment protection, but against the proposal to upgrade specific sections in limestone. This brought support for the addition of rock revetment to the foreshore to 94% in favour.

## Legislation / Policy

*Local Government Act 1995, section 3.57*  
*Local Government (Functions and General) Regulations 1996, Part 4*  
City of Nedlands Policy – 'Purchasing of Goods and Services'

## Budget/Financial Implications

Within current approved budget: Yes  No   
Requires further budget consideration: Yes  No

The preferred tenderers price is detailed in confidential Attachment 1.

Some quantities in the highest scoring submission appeared to be inconsistent with other tenderers however, following clarification, Natural Area Holdings Pty Ltd confirmed that their tendered price included the specified quantities.

The inclusion of these items will still result in Stage 1 of the project being completed with the funding staging split up as indicated in the table overleaf:

		16/17	17/18
<b>River Walls Stages 1 &amp; 2 (Iris Avenue to Royal Perth Flying Squadron Yacht Club)</b>	City of Nedlands	\$133,333	\$266,667
	Department of Parks and Wildlife	\$266,667	\$533,333
<b>Totals</b>		\$400,000	\$800,00

  

<b>Total</b>	<b>\$1,200,000</b>
--------------	--------------------

The City currently has \$1,200,000 allocated in the 2016/17 financial year budget. The balance of this budget will be carried forward to the 2017/18 financial year for the completion of Stage 2 of the project.

## Risk Management

Failing to appoint the Contract for the Stage 1 restoration works will impact on the City’s ability to repair wall and protect the foreshore and amenity of the area for the public. A risk assessment on the wall has identified the loss of the wall itself as the most adverse outcome, with subsequent loss of park land. This would be a highly undesirable outcome for the City.

Key risk areas, including financial and regulatory risks, have been addressed through the control measures applied through the tender documentation and evaluation process.

The Administration has been working with DPaW to ensure that their requirements have been met throughout all of the design and planning works. This included the appointment of a supervising engineer to provide specialist assistance in supervising the quality control of the works.

## Discussion

Final designs for the Stage 1 reconstruction works form part of the tender that was released. The tender submissions were evaluated by the City, DPaW and M P Rogers (consultant) in accordance with the qualitative criteria specified in the tender documentation.

The priced items were compiled into a spreadsheet for analysis of value comparison. A price criteria score was allocated based on the best value being scored at 100% and other values scored proportionally against this price.

The final evaluation score and price is published in Confidential Attachment 1.

## **Conclusion**

After an assessment of the submitted tenders it is proposed that the tender submission received from Natural Area Holdings Pty Ltd be accepted having provided the best overall value to the City of Nedlands. This submission scored 86% overall.

## **Attachments**

1. Confidential Tender Assessment (not to be published); and
2. Stage 1 River Wall Plan.